

DTP/97/40

May 1997

Large-order Behaviour of the QCD Adler D-function in Planar Approximation

C.J. Maxwell

*Centre for Particle Theory, University of Durham
South Road, Durham, DH1 3LE, England*

Abstract

We consider the structure of the leading ultra-violet (UV) renormalon singularity associated with the QCD vacuum polarization Adler D-function, in the approximation that only planar Feynman diagrams are retained. This “planar approximation” results in some simplifications, in particular three of the four potential contributions from four-fermion operators are shown to be absent. We are able to obtain a fully normalized result for the leading $n \rightarrow \infty$ behaviour of the portion of perturbative coefficients proportional to $N_f^{n-r} N^r$, for $SU(N)$ QCD with N_f quark flavours.

The large-order behaviour of QCD perturbation series and the structure of the renormalon singularities which give rise to it have attracted a great deal of recent research interest [1]. For the QCD vacuum polarization Adler D -function the leading large-order behaviour is generated by an ultra-violet (UV) renormalon. The structure of this Borel plane singularity can be identified following the work of Parisi [2], by considering the insertion of dimension-six operators into the Green function which generates D [3]. In this paper we wish to make use of the results of ref.[3] to study the asymptotics of the perturbative coefficients of D in the “planar approximation” where at each order in the $1/N_f$ expansion in $SU(N)$ QCD with N_f quark flavours, only the leading contribution in the large- N limit is retained. This corresponds to the evaluation of planar Feynman diagrams [4], and in this approximation some simplifications occur.

The Adler D -function is defined in terms of the correlator $\Pi(s)$ of two vector currents in the Euclidean region,

$$\Pi(s)(q_\mu q_\nu - g_{\mu\nu} q^2) = 4\pi^2 i \int d^4x e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot\mathbf{x}} \langle 0 | T \{ J_\mu(x) J_\nu(0) \} | 0 \rangle , \quad (1)$$

where $s = -q^2 > 0$. By taking a derivative in s one avoids an unspecified constant and defines

$$D(s) = -s \frac{d}{ds} \Pi(s) . \quad (2)$$

In $SU(N)$ QCD perturbation theory,

$$D(s) = N \sum_f Q_f^2 \left(1 + \frac{3}{4} C_F \tilde{D} \right) + \left(\sum_f Q_f \right)^2 \tilde{D} , \quad (3)$$

where Q_f denotes the electric charge of the quarks and the summation is over the flavours accessible at a given energy. The $SU(N)$ Casimirs are $C_A = N$, $C_F = (N^2 - 1)/2N$. $\tilde{D}$ denotes the contribution of “light-by-light” diagrams which first enter at $O(\alpha_s^3)$ in perturbation theory. We shall be interested in the corrections to the parton model result, $\tilde{D}$, which in “planar approximation” have the form,

$$\tilde{D} = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} d_n a^{n+1} + O\left(\frac{1}{N^2}\right) , \quad (4)$$

where $d_0 = 1$ and $a \equiv \alpha_s/\pi$ is the RG-improved coupling. We stress that the d_n correspond to the perturbative coefficients in “planar approximation”. Crucially each d_n is then a sum of multinomials in N_f and N of degree n ,

$$\begin{aligned} d_n &= \sum_{r=0}^n N_f^{n-r} N^r d_n^{[n-r]} \\ &= \sum_{r=0}^n b^{n-r} N^r d_n^{(n-r)}, \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

where the $d_n^{[n-r]}$, $d_n^{(n-r)}$ are pure numbers. $b \equiv (11N - 2N_f)/6$ is the first QCD beta-function coefficient. The second expression is the “ b -expansion” [5-7] obtained by rewriting $N_f = (11N - 6b)/2$.

Our aim is to obtain asymptotic results for $d_n^{[n-r]}$ and $d_n^{[r]}$, for fixed r and large n . Representing $\tilde{D}$ as a Borel integral,

$$\tilde{D} = \int_0^\infty dz e^{-z/a} B[\tilde{D}](z). \quad (6)$$

The Borel transform $B[\tilde{D}](z)$ is expected to have a leading UV renormalon singularity at $z = -2/b$. As noted earlier this should receive contributions from the insertion of dimension-six operators, so that

$$B[\tilde{D}](z) = \sum_i \frac{K_i + O(1 + bz/2)}{(1 + bz/2)^{\delta_i}}, \quad (7)$$

where the sum is over the contribution of operators $\mathcal{O}_i$. The exponents δ_i have the form

$$\delta_i = p_i - (2c/b) + \lambda_i, \quad (8)$$

where p_i is an integer, c denotes the second universal beta-function coefficient,

$$c = \left[-\frac{7}{8} \frac{C_A^2}{b} - \frac{11}{8} \frac{C_A C_F}{b} + \frac{5}{4} C_A + \frac{3}{4} C_F \right], \quad (9)$$

and λ_i denotes the one-loop anomalous dimension of the operator.

In the “planar approximation” the residues K_i and exponents δ_i can only involve the ratio N/b in order to reproduce the multinomials $b^{n-r} N^r$ in eq.(5). That is we must have,

$$\begin{aligned}
K_i &= \sum_m K_i^{(m)} \left(\frac{N}{b}\right)^m \\
\delta_i &= \sum_m \delta_i^{(m)} \left(\frac{N}{b}\right)^m,
\end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

where the $K_i^{(m)}$ and $\delta_i^{(m)}$ are pure numbers. The combination N/b is the organizing parameter of an expansion in the number of renormalon chains exchanged in QCD planar diagrams, and replaces the $1/N_f$ appropriate to the chain expansion in QED [8].

To obtain the large- N_f asymptotics $d_n^{[n]}$ we need to consider the one-chain contribution generated by the operator $\mathcal{O}_1 \equiv (1/g^4)\partial_\nu F^{\nu\mu}\partial^\rho F_{\rho\mu}$, with g the QCD coupling and $F_{\mu\nu}$ the field strength tensor associated with the external vector source. The large- N_f behaviour is of course known exactly [9, 10]. The one-loop anomalous dimension of $\mathcal{O}_1$ vanishes and

$$\delta_1 = 2 - (2c/b). \tag{11}$$

If we work for convenience in the “V-scheme” ($\overline{\text{MS}}$ with scale $\mu^2 = e^{-5/3}s$) then one finds $K_1^{(0)} = 4/9$ [5, 9]. Exchanges of two and more renormalon chains will involve the four-fermion operators $\mathcal{O}_V$ and $\mathcal{O}_A$ [3, 11],

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{O}_V &\equiv (\bar{\psi}\gamma_\mu T^A \psi)(\bar{\psi}\gamma^\mu T^A \psi) \\
\mathcal{O}_A &\equiv (\bar{\psi}\gamma_\mu \gamma_5 T^A \psi)(\bar{\psi}\gamma^\mu \gamma_5 T^A \psi),
\end{aligned} \tag{12}$$

where T^A denotes colour matrices (these correspond to $\mathcal{O}_3, \mathcal{O}_4$ in ref.[3]). The remaining four-fermion operators which do not contain T^A ($\mathcal{O}_1, \mathcal{O}_2$ in ref.[3]) will not contribute in the “planar approximation” since they will be suppressed by powers of N .

The corresponding anomalous dimensions of the diagonal operator combinations of $\mathcal{O}_V$ and $\mathcal{O}_A$ can be obtained from the anomalous dimension matrix computed in ref.[3]. On discarding contributions which vanish in “planar approximation” one finds,

$$\lambda_\pm = \frac{N_f}{3b} \pm \frac{\sqrt{16N_f^2/9 + 9N^2} - 3N}{4b}. \tag{13}$$

In the large- N limit the diagonal operator combinations become $\mathcal{O}_\pm \equiv \mathcal{O}_V \pm \mathcal{O}_A$. After Fierz-ing $\mathcal{O}_-$ is purely scalar and will not contribute to the vector correlator. This can be seen by showing that the large- N behaviour involves traces containing an odd number of gamma matrices, which therefore vanish. Thus $K_-^{(m)} = 0$, $m = 1, 2, 3, \dots$, and there is no branch point with exponent δ_- in “planar approximation”.

Thus in “planar approximation” the relevant Borel plane singularities are the one-chain contribution with branch point exponent δ_1 , and the $\mathcal{O}_+$ contribution with exponent δ_+ . From the explicit large- N two-chain calculation of [12] one can deduce $K_+^{(1)} = -1/18$ (in the V-scheme). The computation of the full residue K_+ would entail a summation of all orders in N/b , requiring exchange of any number of chains in planar diagrams to be calculated.

The large-order behaviour resulting from the i^{th} contribution in eq.(7) is

$$d_n \approx \frac{K_i}{\Gamma(\delta_i)} \left(-\frac{b}{2}\right)^n n^{\delta_i-1} n! (1 + O(1/n)) . \quad (14)$$

The asymptotics are then determined by the operator $\mathcal{O}_i$ with largest δ_i . In both the full theory and in “planar approximation” $\mathcal{O}_+$ is the dominant operator. One has [3]

$$\delta_\pm = 3 - (2c/b) + \lambda_\pm , \quad (15)$$

where $\lambda_+ > 0$ and $\lambda_- < 0$ for $N_f > 0$, $b > 0$, (λ_+, λ_- correspond to λ_1, λ_4 tabulated in ref.[3] for various values of N_f and $N = 3$). $\mathcal{O}_-$ decouples in “planar approximation” as we have seen, and gives only a sub-leading contribution in the full theory. Evidently from eq.(11) the one-chain contribution is subleading by at least $O(1/n)$. Other field operators are also sub-leading in the full theory [3].

Whilst the asymptotics of the full coefficient d_n has an undetermined normalization we shall now show that one can obtain a fully normalized result for the asymptotics of the $d_n^{[n-r]}$ coefficients in “planar approximation”. To derive this we begin by considering the large- N_f limit. In this limit $\lambda_+ = -2$ from eq.(13), and $\lambda_1 = 0$, so that the one-chain contribution dominates by $O(n)$.

Expressing δ_1 in eq.(11) as an expansion in N/b using eq.(9) for c one finds

$$\delta_1 = 2 - \frac{13}{4} \frac{N}{b} + \frac{25}{8} \frac{N^2}{b^2} . \quad (16)$$

Setting $K_1^{(0)} = 4/9$ and systematically expanding $n^{\delta_1-1}/\Gamma(\delta_1)$ in eq.(14) in powers of N/b one then obtains

$$d_n \approx \frac{4}{9} \left(-\frac{b}{2} \right)^n nn! \left[1 + \frac{N}{b} \left(\frac{9}{4} K_1^{(1)} - \frac{13}{4} (\ln n - (1 - \gamma)) \right) + \dots \right], \quad (17)$$

where $\gamma = 0.57722\dots$ is the Euler-Mascheroni constant which arises in the expansion of $\Gamma(\delta_1)$. The asymptotics of the sub-leading “ b -expansion” coefficients $d_n^{(n-r)}$ can be obtained from successive terms in the square bracket in eq.(17). Their evaluation would require the calculation of the $K_1^{(m)}$ for $m \leq r$, that is the insertion of the operator $\mathcal{O}_1$ into planar diagrams with at least $r + 1$ renormalon chains.

The large-order behaviour of the $d_n^{[n-r]}$ coefficients on the other hand is determined by the “leading- b ” b^n term in eq.(17). Expanding this using the binomial theorem gives a contribution $n^r N^r N_f^{n-r}/r!$, which will dominate by at least $O(n)$ over the contributions arising from the $(N/b)^m$ terms in the square bracket. Thus one obtains the fully normalized asymptotic behaviour (in the V-scheme)

$$d_n^{[n-r]} \approx \frac{4}{9} n^{r+1} \frac{n!}{r!} 6^{-n} \left(-\frac{11}{2} \right)^r \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \right). \quad (18)$$

Notice that for eq.(18) to hold it is crucial that, as argued above, there is no $\mathcal{O}_-$ contribution in “planar approximation”. In the large- N_f limit $\lambda_- = 0$ and since $\mathcal{O}_-$ first potentially contributes at the two-chain level, and is thus $O(1/N_f)$ suppressed relative to the one-chain contribution, both should contribute equally to the asymptotics of the sub-leading $d_n^{[n-r]}$, $r > 0$. Thus if $K_-^{(1)}$ were not to vanish, the $4/9$ in eq.(18) would be replaced by $\left(\frac{4}{9} + \frac{K_-^{(1)} r}{2} \right)$. The result in eq.(18) was derived in ref.[5] assuming only the one-chain contribution to the leading UV renormalon singularity. We have shown here that it remains valid on including any number of chains.

We now consider the large- N limit and the asymptotics of $d_n^{[r]}$. In this limit $\mathcal{O}_+$ is the dominant operator and $\lambda_+ = 0$ from eq.(13). Thus the one-chain contribution is sub-leading by $O(1/n)$. Returning to eq.(5) we note that it can be rewritten in yet a third form,

$$d_n = \sum_{r=0}^{\infty} b^{n-r} N_f^r d_n^{<n-r>}, \quad (19)$$

so we can obtain an alternative “ b -expansion” by writing $N = (6b + 2N_f)/11$. Correspondingly we can write the residues K_i and exponents δ_i in eq.(7) as expansions in N_f/b .

$$\begin{aligned} K_i &= \sum_m \hat{K}_i^{(m)} \left(\frac{N_f}{b} \right)^m \\ \delta_i &= \sum_m \hat{\delta}_i^{(m)} \left(\frac{N_f}{b} \right)^m, \end{aligned} \quad (20)$$

where the hat distinguishes these coefficients from the N/b expansion in eq.(10). Whilst the N/b expansion corresponds directly to evaluating planar diagrams with an increasing number of renormalon chains, the N_f/b expansion has no such direct diagrammatic interpretation. Evaluation of $\hat{K}_i^{(m)}$ requires an all-orders resummation of the N/b expansion. For instance

$$\hat{K}_+^{(0)} = \sum_{m=1}^{\infty} K_+^{(m)} \left(\frac{6}{11} \right)^m. \quad (21)$$

As noted earlier from the exact large- N two-chain calculation of ref.[12] one can infer $K_+^{(1)} = -1/18$, so with our present knowledge $\hat{K}_+^{(0)} = (-1/33) + \dots$, it is of course not even guaranteed that the sum in eq.(21) converges.

On expanding eq.(13), and eq.(9) for c , in N_f/b one finds

$$\delta_+ = \frac{261}{121} + \frac{263}{726} \frac{N_f}{b} + \frac{3680}{9801} \frac{N_f^2}{b^2} + \dots \quad (22)$$

Inserting these N_f/b expansions into eq.(14) gives, analogous to eq.(17),

$$d_n \approx \frac{\hat{K}_+^{(0)} (-b/2)^n n^{140/121} n!}{\Gamma(261/121)} \left[1 + \frac{N_f}{b} \left(\frac{\hat{K}_+^{(1)}}{\hat{K}_+^{(0)}} + \frac{263}{726} (\ln n - \psi(\frac{261}{121})) \right) + \dots \right] \quad (23)$$

where $\psi(x)$ is the logarithmic derivative of $\Gamma(x)$ which arises in the expansion of $\Gamma(\delta_+)$. In principle the asymptotic behaviour of the $d_n^{<n-r>}$ coefficients in the alternative “ b -expansion” in eq.(19) can be derived from the successive terms in the square bracket in eq.(23). However, as pointed out above, the evaluation of the $\hat{K}_+^{(m)}$ requires a resummation of any number of renormalon chains.

The large-order behaviour of the $d_n^{[r]}$ coefficients will again be determined by the “leading- b ” b^n term in eq.(23). On expansion using the binomial theorem one obtains a contribution $n^r N_f^r N^{n-r}/r!$, which will dominate by at least $O(n)$ over the $(N_f/b)^m$ terms in the square bracket. So that the leading large-order behaviour is

$$d_n^{[r]} \approx \frac{\hat{K}_+^{(0)}}{\Gamma(261/121)} n^{r+140/121} \frac{n!}{r!} \left(-\frac{11}{12}\right)^n \left(-\frac{2}{11}\right)^r \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)\right). \quad (24)$$

Whilst the evaluation of $\hat{K}_+^{(0)}$ would require the all-chains resummation of eq.(21) by taking ratios we can arrive at the fully normalized result

$$\frac{d_n^{[r]}}{d_n^{[s]}} \approx n^{r-s} \frac{s!}{r!} \left(-\frac{2}{11}\right)^{r-s} \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)\right). \quad (25)$$

Similarly from eq.(18) for $d_n^{[n-r]}$ one can obtain

$$\frac{d_n^{[n-r]}}{d_n^{[n-s]}} \approx n^{r-s} \frac{s!}{r!} \left(-\frac{11}{2}\right)^{r-s} \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)\right). \quad (26)$$

The results in eqs.(25),(26) hold universally for any QCD observable whose large- N and large- N_f asymptotics are each dominated by a *single* branch-point (operator) in the Borel plane. For instance in the present case of the vector correlator we have seen that the large- N asymptotics are dominated by $\mathcal{O}_+$, and the large- N_f asymptotics by the one-chain contribution. This ensures the weak dominance of the large- N and large- N_f derived “leading- b ” terms evident in eqs.(18) and (24), that is on binomial expansion they generate the correct leading asymptotics for $d_n^{[r]}$ and $d_n^{[n-r]}$.

An amusing speculation is that if one were able to perform the all-chains summation in eq.(21) one would find $\hat{K}_+^{(0)} = 0$, then assuming that the $O(1 + bz/2)$ term in the numerator of the δ_+ contribution also vanished in the large- N limit, the leading large- N asymptotics would in fact come from the one-chain contribution. If the two and higher chain contributions to the residue K_1 also summed to zero in the large- N limit,

$$\sum_{m=1}^{\infty} K_1^{(m)} \left(\frac{6}{11}\right)^m = 0, \quad (27)$$

then the standard large- N_f derived “leading- b ” term, which is clearly exact in the large- N_f limit, would also give the correct leading asymptotic behaviour in the large- N limit, up to $n^{-2c/b}$ effects dependent on the second beta-function coefficient which vanish in large- N_f but contribute in large- N . This would give the “leading- b ” approximation [5-7], which has found extensive phenomenological application [5,7,13-15], a much stronger motivation.

We stress that this is pure speculation. The only fact at our disposal is the two-chain approximation to $\hat{K}_+^{(0)}$ derived from the calculation of ref.[12], $\hat{K}_+^{(0)} \approx -1/33$. This small and negative value makes it not inconceivable that K_+ has a zero at $N_f = 0$ (equivalent to the large- N limit $N/b = 6/11$ in “planar approximation”) and is thereafter positive for $N_f > 0$ in asymptotically-free QCD.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Martin Beneke for a number of stimulating and informative discussions which have crucially helped in the development of this work. The CERN TH Division is thanked for its hospitality during the period when this work was completed.

References

- [1] For a recent review see: Jan Fischer, “On the Role of Power Expansions in Quantum Field Theory”, PRA-HEP 97/06 [hep-ph/9704351].
- [2] G.Parisi, Phys. Lett. **B76** (1978) 65.
- [3] M.Beneke,V.M.Braun and N.Kivel, “Large-order Behaviour due to Ultraviolet Renormalons in QCD”, CERN-TH/97-50 [hep-ph/9703389].
- [4] G.‘t Hooft ,Commun. Math. Phys. 86 (1982) 449.
- [5] C.N.Lovett-Turner and C.J.Maxwell , Nucl. Phys. **B432** (1994) 147 ;
ibid **B452** (1995) 188.
- [6] D.Broadhurst and A.G.Grozin, Phys. Rev. **D52** (1995) 4082.
- [7] M.Beneke and V.M.Braun, Phys. Lett. **B348** (1995) 513.
- [8] M.Beneke and V.A.Smirnov, Nucl. Phys. **B472** (1996) 529.
- [9] M.Beneke, Nucl. Phys. **B405** (1993) 424.
- [10] D.J.Broadhurst, Z. Phys. **C58** (1993) 339.
- [11] A.I.Vainshtein and V.I. Zakharov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 73 (1994) 1207 [Erratum: ibid 75 (1995) 3588]; Phys. Rev. **D54** (1996) 4039.
- [12] S.Peris and E.de Rafael, “Low Energy QCD and Ultraviolet Renormalons” [hep-ph/9701418].
- [13] P.Ball,M.Beneke and V.M.Braun, Nucl. Phys. **B452** (1995) 563.
- [14] M.Neubert, Nucl. Phys. **B463** (1996) 511.
- [15] C.J.Maxwell and D.G.Tonge, Nucl. Phys. **B481** (1996) 681.